The plans and the pennies from heaven: narratives from male dominated environments

Silvia Gherardi
Research Unit on Communication, Organizational Learning and Aesthetics
University of Trento
www.unitn.it/rucola
Her/story and His/story

- How is the masculinity of ‘male jobs’ produced, maintained and reproduced?

- What happens when She enter a male dominated terrain? Her/story…..

- How He reacts to this event? His/story….
Working-mates: who’s who

She:
- agricultural technician
- branch managers inspector
- Veterinary surgeon
- site surveyor
- IT consultant
- Designer
- production plan manager
- leak detector
- Editor
- production manager
- quality manager
- chemical surveyor

He:
- A work-mate (or a superior) who was already working in the group when she came in.
Her/story:

- The rhetorics: pennies from heaven

- The plot of the story: CHALLENGE
  as symbolic presence;
  as struggle;
  as adventure;
  as affirmation;
  as gender denial.
Smart about everything... except men

ALLIED ARTISTS PRODUCTIONS presents

BRIAN AHERNE
CONSTANCE BENNETT
BARRY SULLIVAN

"Smart Woman"
Challange as symbolic presence: the right to ‘be there’

“After I’d been promoted over these male colleagues who’d previously been my superiors, we always got on well because I never put myself forward … so people almost always went to my colleague and I let them talk to him, and then on the quiet I decided, it was me who signed … like that, but I’ve never imposed my authority and humiliated people, or thrown my weight around, so the atmosphere has always been tranquil” (Woman, 59, inspector in a bank)
GUERRILLA GIRL

Young and innocent... fighting her oppressors with weapon no woman should know about!

HELMUT DANTINE in "Guerrilla Girl"

and introducing MARIANNA

Directed by JOHN CHRISTIAN
Challenge as struggle: 
*proud Amazons*

“...I’d say that in the past three years I’ve begun treading on people’s toes, especially the senior managers’, because I know what I know, and I’m now trying to assert myself much more than I did at the beginning [...] You realize that when the time comes for you to show your professionalism, you always have to fight. Now they’ve changed the organization chart, I’m the only woman with an office and, guess what, when they convened the first meeting for the office heads, they didn’t tell me about it: so I went along and asked them, and they said ‘Ah, well, you know, there’s been a slip-up, we forgot’; it’s a constant struggle” (Woman, 43, editor in a television)
**Challenge as adventure:**

**work as passion**

I was the tomboy in the family. I started at thirteen with my grandfather; I did the wiring with my grandfather when I was thirteen, there are three of us females, my grandfather needed some help, and I ... with a chisel and a hammer we laid the cables, wires, we installed the light fittings, the switches; when I was five he taught me how to change the wheel on my bike. When I made my choice my mama burst into tears; I remember my first year at technical school, with sticking plasters on my hands, when we did machine tuning, I got blisters because I wasn’t used to it, and I remember that I cried, that they told me I should change schools, that it didn’t matter if I lost a year” (Woman, 30, leak detector in a metalworking company).
UNIVERSAL presents

IDEA GIRL

with

JESS BARKER  JULIE BISHOP
ALAN MOWBRAY  GEORGE DOLENZ
JOAN FULTON

and

CHARLIE BARNET
and His Orchestra
Challenge as affirmation: the feeling of risk and fulfilment

I was at Agency X, and the post of the head of the overseas office fell vacant, and they asked if there was anyone interested in replacing the person taking early retirement. At the time I didn’t know much about overseas, I had the basics, but because I’d never worked in that sector, my knowledge was obviously skimpy. I thought for a moment, ten minutes I think, not even that, and then I said, ‘All right, I’ll do it’ (…) You could say I was foolish, but foolishness shouldn’t be confused with strength of will; you can say I was foolish, but I’ve always been convinced, and I’ll repeat it, you have to know what you want in order to get it” (Woman, 36, branch manager in a bank).
Sock Drama of the Gals who Wear the Pants these Days

She's a Soldier Too

with
Beulah Bondi • Nina Foch • Jess Barker
Lloyd Bridges • Percy Kilbride • Ida Moore

Screen Play by Melvin Levy • Produced by WALLACE MacDonald • Directed by WILLIAM CASTLE

A COLUMBIA PICTURE
Challenge as gender denial:
.gender deliberately suppressed

“When they tell me about training courses for women, Women’s Day, it’s as if they’re talking about blacks, poor things who can’t integrate into society; if they talked about a training course for blacks, I’d say ‘What’s the difference between blacks and whites, apart from the fact that perhaps they don’t speak Italian very well?’” (Woman, 28, marketing manager of a wine-producing company).
WOMEN’ POSITIONING

Gender Denial | Struggle
Symbolic Presence | Adventure

Conflict ++ --
Intentionality --- ++
‘men do not tell their stories’

“My name is ….., born in ….. on ….., where I have my permanent residence. So, I went to nursery school in ….., elementary school in ….. [the account continues for a page, exactly with a further 981 words, and concludes as follows]. This in brief is my career in the company […] If you have no specific questions, I have nothing to add” (Man, 53, head of customer care in a processing company).
Frances Langford

Career Girl

Edward Norris

Iris Adrian

Craig Woods, Linda Brent, Ariel Heath

Produced by Jack Schwarz, Directed by Wallace W. Fox
The indifferent

“[Her entry] caused some commotion and argument among the laddish clique. They said ‘Hey, it’s a woman, now the women are taking over, in a few years’ time they’ll be in command’, the usual griping. And of course she had to do much more than anyone else to show that she was up to running the branch and doing it well. Why? Because she was being constantly watched, and not only by the general management – because it may also be that someone there was prejudiced against women and clobbered her if something went wrong – but she was also scrutinised by her other colleagues, so that, unlike us, she always had to make maximum effort to get everything right, to achieve the best results, to show that a woman is able to run a section. (…). But she was also an exception, she found herself in the right place at the right time. Someone left, and she was the only person who could run that particular service … so they had to give her the job. This woman, who was in the right place, stepped in for three months and then they automatically had to promote her. And she probably deserved it, but I know that there were doubts at the last moment, they would have liked to move her so as not to promote her, but there wasn’t anyone else to put in, so they had to leave her there.” (Man, 56, agency manager in a bank)
The ‘risk-taker’

“Not that I’m boasting, but when I was on shift I was the first to pick a woman as coordinator. I was the first to make me a woman shift leader, so that when I went off shift, I handed over to this girl; who has developed quite successfully, and I’ve got on very well with these workers” (Man, 35, production manager in a metalworking company).
The paternalistic

“She’s a bit too laid back in the good sense of the expression. She doesn’t get angry, she’s patient, sometimes too too patient. I intervene when the others take advantage of her good nature and get her to do more than she should. I intervene and I say to her: ‘No, you answer him like this, and you tell him where to go’. So I have to say to her: ‘Tell him to sort it out himself, tell him to call back later’. She’s too helpful, she’s incapable of saying ‘no’. Or perhaps she doesn’t know whether to say ‘yes’ or ‘no’, in the sense that she perhaps doesn’t know the service’s policy, so I have to step in. More than anything else to hold her back. She’d do anything they ask.” (Man, 33, veterinary coordinator of a breeders’ consortium).
"I fly because I need the money for my mother and my brother!"

"I fly because I love someone who thinks flying’s the greatest thing in the world!"

"I fly because it’s made me feel things... and put me so close to my husband!"

Alice, Constance, Nancy

FAYE • BENNETT • KELLY

TAIL SPIN

Joan - Charles with Jane Kane
Davis - Farrell - Wyman - Richmond
Nally - Vernon - Warren - Hymer - Joan - Valerie - Edward - Norris

Directed by Roy Del Ruth
Original Screen Play by Frank Wead
Associate Producer Henry Joe Brown
Music and Lyrics by Hollack & Bullock, Gordon & Revel

Darryl F. Zanuck, in Charge of Production
A 20th Century-Fox Picture

Three women of the sky!... the heart-throbs behind their spectacular lives... the thrills that come with their split-second escapes... in a smashing romantic melodrama of adventure!

Every woman on earth will know what’s in her heart—what makes them take the gamble they can lose only once!
"I personally believe that my wife is very good at her job. I’ve made every effort to make sure that she’s not penalized by the family, we’ve got two children. When she was due to go back to work after maternity leave she said: ‘I almost think I’ll take some time off …’

‘you won’t take anything, you’ll go back to work’
‘but the children’
‘we’ll get some help, we’ll hire a nanny’.

Perhaps I forced my wife, she went back to work on the exact day she was supposed to, without asking for even a day’s extension. (...) Both my work problems and hers have always been considered. She knows what it means to work long hours; I know what it means to be a free professional: working until a week before the birth and then resuming five days afterwards. So when I think about those women who take maternity leave for two years, I absolutely do not agree” (Man, 36, public relations manager of a wine-producing company).
MEN’ POSITIONING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTIVE ATTITUDE</th>
<th>PATERNALISTIC</th>
<th>CADET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LOW</td>
<td>INDIFFERENT</td>
<td>RISK-TAKER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIGH</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EMOTIONAL INVOLVEMENT

LOW

HIGH
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of challenge</th>
<th>Reaction of male colleagues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Symbolic presence</td>
<td>Condescension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Struggle</td>
<td>Discredit, opposition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>Invisibility (private matter)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affirmation</td>
<td>Admiration, exceptionality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender denial</td>
<td>Appreciation or hostility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Her challenge and His reaction
It was tough. But I managed!

We welcomed her with open arms! There was no problem.
The masculinity of male work....

- is asserted, practised and theorized in order to discipline all those engaged in that work, both to defend the territory and to exclude discursive formations alternative to it.

- the rhetoric that sustain the masculinity of male work can be represented as discursive forms of surveillance and discipline matched by forms of compliance and/or resistance.

- Surveillance, Resistance, Observance
Discursive practices as ‘normalizing micro-processes’

- Silencing the masculine: making gender synonymous with ‘of women’,
- Naturalizing gender: depicting motherhood as a social destiny,
- De-socializing work time: work time and the practices associated with it in terms of immutable schedules and places of work,
- Using disqualification heuristics if the same behaviour is enacted by a man or a woman: second sexing
An example (naturalizing maternity, de-socializing time)

- “It’s pointless, because like it or not, some day a woman is going to have a child, and then… Already a woman can’t work the hours that we do, because we have a ten-hour daily schedule, eight hours at any rate, eleven, nine. I mean we have a strange schedule which a woman couldn’t work because, as I said, one day a woman is going to have a child and then everything changes, and what are we supposed to do? We haven’t got a manageress at the moment, but we’ve got someone with the right qualifications. I told this to the inspectors. It’s not that she shouldn’t become manageress but I find it ridiculous, because … I mean, it’s not an office job” (Man, 29, assistant shop manager in a supermarket).
disqualification heuristics......

“One of the problems I had when there were more women here than men was that they’d form these cliques, they’d look to see what the others were wearing, how they’d changed their clothes ... So they somehow competed among themselves, but they weren’t only competitive in their work, they were also competitive in their behaviour outside work, about their clothes ... I mean, they’d keep watch on each other. They’d even come to me and say, ‘Have you seen so-and-so? This morning she was wearing a dress, and when she came in this afternoon she’d changed’” (Man, 56, agency manager of a bank).